Concept mapping of photo voices: Neighbourhood and health

Nasim Haque, MD, DrPH
Director, Community Health
Wellesley Institute, Toronto

3rd Annual Workshop on Dynamic Modeling for Health Policy: Understanding SDoH & Reducing Health Inequities
University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon
July 20, 2011
About St James Town Initiative

• SJT Initiative is a 5 year CBPR Initiative - Wellesley funded

• Research question: What are neighbourhood implications on the health & well-being of immigrants?

• Results: Inform policy & support social change at neighbourhood level
Strategies & Activities

Multi-Pronged Approach

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

Participatory research

Skill enhancing opportunities

Student internships

Work with multiple stakeholders

SJT Initiative website

Community Action

SJT Residents Action Group

1) Photo Voice  2) Community Mapping  3) Concept Mapping

4) Focus groups/interviews  5) Survey (CAC)
St. James Town

Population & Neighbourhood
- 14,666 Residents on 0.23 km\(^2\) of Land
- 64,636 People / km\(^2\)
  (Unofficial Estimate: 25,000)
- 64% Immigrants
- 18 Aging High-Rise Buildings
- Over 50 languages spoken
What is Photovoice?

Economic Disparities

This tiny tunnel connects one of the poorest neighbourhoods in Canada, St. James Town, to one of the most affluent, Rosedale. The short journey is actually painful, arduous, and for not all, of the individuals living in St. James Town, gainful employment.

Photovoice asks you to take photographs of things that are important to you – and tell a story about why these things are important. It can be used to define problems that exist and create solutions.
Why Photovoice?

• Non threatening method for research resistant community
• Not conceived as research
• Engage disadvantaged population (newcomers)
• Built trust and empower newcomer population
• Transfer ownership of the project to participants
• Help residents’ voices be heard by decision makers
• Understand residents perspectives on neighbourhood and health through their lenses
Reported Length of Residency in SJT

- 0-4 years: 46%
- 5-9 years: 29%
- 10+ years: 25%

Self-Identification of Ethnicity

- East Asian: 14%
- South Asian: 36%
- Caribbean: 11%
- East African: 11%
- North American: 11%
- South East Asian: 7%
Validation of Photovoice Findings
“When we first came here, we had very high expectations because we were coming to Toronto…but it is not good. Nobody takes care of the surroundings. On apartment terraces, you cannot see flowers. People are always storing things there. It is ugly. I can find gardens near my building, but they are not managed nicely. There is a lot of garbage here. Surroundings are important - they make me smile and relax, so I can go with a smiling face.”
St. James Town - 2005

Population: 14,666 residents
Area: 0.23km²
Density: 64,636 people/km²
7214 private dwellings. 100% are rented, not owned
98% of apartments are in buildings with 5 or more storeys

64% of residents are newcomers
37% arrived between 2001-2006
66% of residents speak a 1st language other than English or French
48 different languages are spoken by residents
A few examples of the range of information that can be collected using Photovoice technique...
These different flowers represent people from different places and the vase represents this country. If we arrange the flowers properly, they turn into a beautiful flower arrangement. If people of different backgrounds are given equal opportunities and are accepted, everyone benefits.
The picture shows a memorial of a residence of St. James Town whose life was robbed off him last year due to gun violence. The person who murdered “Juice” is yet to be found. It just comes to show that more security is needed in the area. A lot of undercover police are the area dressing up as drug dealers or buyers but they are usually easily spotted and pin pointed.
PHYSICAL ATTRIBUTES

Neighbourhood Amenities
How much can we trust our food supply? We don’t only care about the price of goods, we also pay attention to our health. We want to get good service when we go to the supermarket.
What is Concept Mapping

- Concept mapping is a systems method that enables a group to describe its ideas on any topic and represent these ideas visually in a map i.e. in a shared conceptual framework

- This framework forms the basis for further value analysis, planning, action, or evaluation

- Bill Trochim
Planning: Planners and key issue advisors develop a *focus prompt* and *identify participants*

**Idea Generation:** Communities of interest and expertise are identified, and respond with *brainstormed ideas*

**Structuring:** Communities of interest and expertise *sort and rate* the results of the idea development, authoring the structure and value domain of the issue

**Representation:** Compute the maps, *pattern matches and “go zones,”* and prepare them for interpretation by communities of interest.

**Interpretation and Use:** *Strategies and tactics for action* follow directly from the *interpretation* of the results. Pattern matches and go zones help build consensus on action.

1. All photo cannot be in one pile
2. Could not be into a single pile
3. not be in 2 piles simultaneously
4. Not be any miscellaneous pile

Impact of neighbourhood on health & wellbeing

Through Photovoice

CM Methodology Steps

1. All photo cannot be in one pile
2. Could not be into a single pile
3. not be in 2 piles simultaneously
4. Not be any miscellaneous pile
Why we chose concept mapping?

• Systems based method that could retain participatory & visual nature of the project
• To transform the visual cues into an interconnected framework to guide program planning
• To enable other residents to engage in discussions about the perceived importance of those factors and the potential for action to be taken to support identified factors.
What is Concept Mapping of Photovoice?

Idea represented in photographs...

...are sorted into groups...

...and rated on two areas.

1. Relative importance
2. Potential for action
Project completed in 2 phases

1) Photovoice: 27 participants generated ideas through pictures & stories focusing both on positive and negative attributes of their neighbourhood

2) Concept Mapping: (PV=17 + 24 new) = 41 participants
Concept Mapping takes the ideas of individuals and combines using multivariate statistical methods to form unique visual representations called Concept Maps.

- MDS
- Hierarchical cluster analyses
The map shows all the elements in relation to one another.

Each point represents one statement.

Smoker think it is ok to throw cigarette ends where beautiful flowers are blooming. We need environmental trng. to show people how imp. the environ. is to health. (34)
Conceptually **similar ideas** are in **close proximity**

- Smoker think it is ok to throw cigarette ends where beautiful flowers are blooming. **We need environmental trng. to show people how imp. the environ. is to health.** (34)

- Someone has dumped garbage on someone else’s bike. The public needs to be aware of the garbage situation in SJT. There needs to be **more action taken to improve the environ. of our community** (50)
Conceptually **different ideas are further apart**

“The Philosopher’s Stone” In this wasteland of no opportunities, this is the only chance of winning (19)

Although there are public garbage bins in SJT, there are very few of them…(46)

We have more & more buildings but we have less & less green space. It is easy to take the green out of the city but it is hard to get it back. (72)
The Emerging Structure: the detailed ideas are organized into groups

1. Education
2. Sense of Pride
3. Society
4. Lack of Maintenance and Improvement
5. Green Space
6. Attractions
7. Environment
8. Improvement for Health
9. Need Social and Protection
10. Safety

...contains all the details and provides a conceptual framework.
Each cluster retains the details

We live in such a crowded place and we don’t have enough green space. Plants give us oxygen & give us a beautiful visual sense as well. (76)

This is a soothing sight for tired eyes, an effective distraction from the barren concrete jungle around...(6)

..... making SJT look beautiful and clean would make residents feel good about themselves (53)

Green space is very important. The addition of green space to a building can provide a sense of community since tenants can get to know one another as they enjoy this space together. This is Allen gardens. Residents should not have to go outside the community to find quality parks with good amenities. (67)

The hopes and dreams of the residents could be expressed in the development of a beautiful common space together. A lush green urban space is the dream of everyone in SJT; however this is difficult because residents do not own this land or feel a sense of ownership. (9)
A Shared Framework: regional view of CM

...complete with high-level domains and groups of characteristics.
Pattern Matching is a process that allows the comparison of opinions or view to determine the degree to which groups or ideas match or disconnect.
Go-Zones: Comparing Statements in a Cluster

A Go-Zone Report is a bivariate scatter plot that shows how the items in a cluster are related.
Value to both methods

**Photovoice**
- Explores the use of different input material
- Provides an empowering way for marginalized populations to participate

**Concept Mapping**
- Is a systems method and provides additional structure
- Enables the collective analysis of photographs
- Helps organize further priority and action
SJT Residents at Work: Sorting the Photo Voice Photos
Examining the Relationships in the Concept Map
Residents Group
Presenting at Counselor’s office
Audit of Bicycle Parking

Change & Action
How can concept mapping of photovoice complement SDM?

- Problem identification by community people
- Engaging non-scientists in the scientific process.
- Sorting & rating and discussion
- Engagement & learning of stakeholders from very beginning
- Consensus building after deliberation
- Prioritization of issues for action and theory building

Model development & simulations
Added Value

Concept Mapping of photovoice

Macro/Social data

Social, economic surveys; Census

Theory, narrative accounts

Simulation

Micro/Individual data

Qualitative, behavioural, social psychological data

Centre for Policy Modelling, Manchester Metropolitan Univ. Business School
Acknowledgement

Scott Rosas: Senior Consultant, Concept Systems, Inc.

Estelle Sun: RA, Wellesley Institute

Ali Moallim: Community Leader, St. James Town

Sean McIntyre: Constituency Assistant to Area Councillor

St. James Town residents and staff & colleagues at WI
THANK YOU

ST. JAMES TOWN INITIATIVE
www.sjtinitiative.com
THANK YOU
Please visit us at
www.wellesleyinstitute.com